## CHE

## Identifying the Best: <br> The CHE ExcellenceRanking 2010

Sonja Berghoff<br>Uwe Brandenburg<br>Diane Carr-Boulay<br>Cort-Denis Hachmeister<br>Hannah Leichsenring<br>Frank Ziegele

CHE Centre for Higher Education Development gGmbH
Verler Str. 6
D-33332 Gütersloh

Telephone: ++49 (0) 524197610
Telefax: ++49 (0) 5241976140
E-Mail: info@che.de
Internet: www.che.de

## CHE

## Identifying the Best: The CHE ExcellenceRanking 2010

Sonja Berghoff<br>Uwe Brandenburg<br>Diane Carr-Boulay<br>Cort-Denis Hachmeister<br>Hannah Leichsenring<br>Frank Ziegele


#### Abstract

The CHE Centre for Higher Education Development has designed an "ExcellenceRanking", a ranking of a selected group of European Universities. The CHE applied a two-step approach for analysis. First, all European departments in the surveyed fields were compared by a few general indicators. Second, for those departments that excelled in these indicators, an indepth analysis was run based on an institutional questionnaire and a student survey.


The first issue of the ranking, released in 2007, concentrated on the natural sciences and mathematics. The second issue, released in 2009, was dedicated to economics, political science and psychology. In 2010, the study was repeated for the natural sciences. This paper covers the results from the 2009 and 2010 issues.

## Table of contents

1 Genesis and Philosophy ..... 5
2 Target Groups ..... 6
3 Basic Methodology ..... 7
3.1 Preselection ..... 7
3.2 In-Depth Analysis ..... 11
4 Results of the Preselection ..... 13
4.1 Country level ..... 13
4.2 Findings on the University Level ..... 15
4.2.1 Distribution of Excellence Group Placements across Universities ..... 15
4.3 Findings for the Single Subjects ..... 21
4.3.1 Biology (2010) ..... 21
4.3.2 Chemistry (2010) ..... 24
4.3.3 Economics (2009) ..... 26
4.3.4 Mathematics (2010) ..... 30
4.3.5 Physics (2010) ..... 32
4.3.6 Political Science (2009) ..... 36
4.3.7 Psychology (2009) ..... 39
5 Results of the In-Depth-Analysis ..... 41
5.1 Institutional Survey ..... 41
5.1.1 Proportion of International Staff and Students ..... 42
5.1.2 Proportion of Female Staff and Students ..... 43
5.2 Students' Judgements ..... 43
6 References ..... 48

## List of Tables

Table 1: Number of departments and universities in the Excellence Group (aggregated for 2009 and 2010) ..... 13
Table 2: Distribution of departments according to subjects across countries ..... 13
Table 3: Distribution of excellence group placements across universities ..... 16
Table 4: Stars Table Biology ..... 21
Table 5: Excellence Group Biology ..... 22
Table 6: Stars Table Chemistry ..... 24
Table 7: Excellence Group Chemistry. ..... 25
Table 8: Stars Table Economics ..... 26
Table 9: Excellence Group Economics ..... 28
Table 10: Stars Table Mathematics ..... 30
Table 11: Excellence Group Mathematics. ..... 31
Table 12: Stars Table Physics ..... 32
Table 13: Excellence Group Physics ..... 34
Table 14: Stars Table Political Science ..... 36
Table 15: Excellence Group Political Science ..... 37
Table 16: Stars Table Psychology. ..... 39
Table 17: Excellence Group Psychology ..... 40
Table 18: Response rates in the institutional survey ..... 42
Table 19: Proportion of international staff and students across subjects (in \%) ..... 42
Table 20: Proportion of female staff and students across subjects (in \%) ..... 43
Table 21: Universities participating in the student surveys ..... 44
Table 22: Details on the composition of the indicators ..... 44

## List of Figures

Figure 1: Distribution of departments according to subjects across countries ....................... 14
Figure 2: Percentages of number of placements in the Excellence Group per
university ................................................................................................... 15
Figure 3: Star distribution across countries in Biology .......................................................... 21
Figure 4: Star distribution across countries in Chemistry ...................................................... 24
Figure 5: Star distribution across countries in Economics..................................................... 27
Figure 6: Star distribution across countries in Mathematics.................................................. 30
Figure 7: Star distribution across countries in Physics.......................................................... 33
Figure 8: Star distribution across countries in Political Science ............................................. 36
Figure 9: Star distribution across countries in Psychology.................................................... 39
Figure 10: Proportion of international staff and students across subjects (in \%) ................... 42
Figure 11: Proportion of international staff and students across subjects (in \%) ................... 43
Figure 12: Error bar diagram for chemistry ........................................................................... 46
Figure 13: Average student judgements across fields .......................................................... 47

## 1 Genesis and Philosophy

In 2007, the CHE Centre for Higher Education Development released for the first time the "CHE ExcellenceRanking" in the fields of biology, chemistry, mathematics, and physics. A second issue of the ranking followed in 2009, adding the subjects of political science, psychology and economics ${ }^{1}$. Now, in 2010, the survey for the natural sciences has been repeated and - together with the 2009 results - the combined results are released in this paper as well as on an interactive website ${ }^{2}$.

On the basis of our longstanding experience with ranking European higher education institutions in Austria, Belgium, Germany, the Netherlands, and Switzerland, the CHE intends to contribute to the development of the European Higher Education Area while demonstrating the competitive strength of European universities.

The CHE ExcellenceRanking is one of the strategies to extend the national perspective of the CHE UniversityRanking. Instead of looking at all HEIs for a single country, the approach of the ExcellenceRanking consists of selecting a small number of excellent institutions across Europe for further investigation ${ }^{3}$.

[^0]RANKING

## 2 Target Groups

The CHE ExcellenceRanking targets the following groups:

1. Undergraduates from European and non-European universities intending to earn a master's or PhD degree (or equivalent) in the surveyed fields:

The objective of the CHE ExcellenceRanking is to fill the existing gap of information sought after by students who are in their final stage of (or just finished) their undergraduate studies and who intend to pursue a master's or PhD degree. Besides general information on the institutions in the ranking, these students will benefit by receiving more in-depth information on a highly selective group of top class Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) in the fields of biology, chemistry, mathematics, physics, economics, political science and psychology. The information is presented separately according to the different disciplines and according to the multidimensional approach of the CHE. This approach does not show a league table but rather, depending on different indicators, groups of particularly excellent HEls. The information is divided into the different disciplines and according to the CHE-Ranking Principles:

- Neither an aggregation of individual indicators nor an overall score for an entire HEI, but rather a subject-related presentation of results.
- No weighed overall score for the research performance of a faculty, but rather a consideration of each indicator separately.
- No league table or ranks, but rather profiles of excellent HEls.


## 2. Higher Education Institutions (HEIs):

The excellent HEIs can benefit from the CHE ExcellenceRanking in various ways. Firstly, being selected out of approximately 4.500 HEIs in the whole of Europe may be regarded as a highly useful marketing tool. Secondly, the CHE ExcellenceRanking informs prospective master's and PhD students and thus can be perceived by the included HEls as an outstanding opportunity for student recruitment. Finally, the HEls are able to compare their performance in a broad variety of aspects to that of other European HEls of similar excellence. This will allow them to identify areas in which they may be able to improve upon their standards.

## 3. Organisations and the society at large

Organisations such as foundations and other funding institutions are continuously in need of information regarding excellent higher education institutions whose programmes might best serve their grantees. The CHE ExcellenceRanking will provide such information with an awareness of the limitations of certain indicators. Moreover, it will allow the public to have an inside view into the research abilities and teaching capacities in the surveyed fields of the finest higher education institutions in Europe. Thus, the ranking will help to promote the knowledge society and will also prepare the included fields for the increasing demand for lifelong learning.

## 3 Basic Methodology

The CHE ExcellenceRanking follows the sound and internationally recognised methodological principles ${ }^{4}$ which have been developed by the CHE. These principles include following a discipline-oriented and multidimensional approach, abstaining from a comparison of institutions as a whole and taking the heterogeneous preferences of students into account. In doing so, we emphasize the importance of considering different perspectives from inside the university. Additionally, we highlight our preference to classify institutions in three broad quality clusters, rather than assigning individual ranks that focus on a limited number of universities per subject. Of course, the methodology is adapted to differences deriving from the heterogeneity of countries as well as to the specialities of the fields of analysis. The CHE ExcellenceRanking also adheres to the "Berlin Principles on Ranking of Higher Education Institutions" ${ }^{5}$ as launched during the meeting of the International Ranking Experts Group (IREG) in Berlin in May 2006.

The CHE ExcellenceRanking differs from the established CHE UniversityRanking ${ }^{6}$ in that it looks for examples of excellence throughout the whole of Europe rather than presenting each institution in the context of the entire European higher education setting. It includes the fields of biology, chemistry, mathematics, and physics (for the first time included in 2007, updated in 2010) as well as economics, political science and psychology (published in 2009). For methodological reasons, the scope of the ranking was restricted to these subject areas: Only for these fields could our method of preselecting institutions for the ranking be applied.

### 3.1 Preselection

In the first pre-selection step, European HEls were identified based on five indicators for the fields published in 2009 and in eight indicators for the fields published in 2010. In order to be selected, a minimum of two stars with at least one in publications and citations or three stars altogether was required in 2009, in 2010 the universities needed either two stars in publications and citations or three stars altogether.

Achieving a star means that the respective institution belongs to the group of institutions which account for at least $50 \%$ of the total achievement, e.g. $50 \%$ of the total amount of publications counted for all institutions. The share of stars therefore depends on the shape of the distribution: in the example of publications, if there are few institutions with a large number of publications the distribution is steep and it is thus more difficult to achieve a star than for a smoother distribution.

The CHE is aware that every selection of indicators, however carefully set up, carries the risk of overlooking individual research teams or of not taking into account a specific department with a particular expertise.

The classifications are based on the following indicators:

[^1]- Number of publications ${ }^{7}$ in the web of science

The "size" indicator
This is the number of publications found in the web of science with a query by institution and subject: biology, chemistry, mathematics, and physics, followed by political science, economics and psychology, with the publishing years from 1997 to 2007 for the natural sciences and mathematics as well as 1999-2006 for the other subjects. This indicator is meant as a "size" indicator describing the overall impact of a science department. A star is given to those institutions which have the largest publication output and belong to the group which comprises of at least $50 \%$ of all publications counted. Taken into consideration were those universities with at least 3.000 publications counted in the web of science in the years 1997 to 2007 (resp. 1999 to 2006), across all subjects.

This indicator was chosen for both the 2009 and 2010 rounds.

- Citations (normalized to the international standard)

The "reception" indicator
This indicator compares the average number of citations received by the papers of a research unit (CPP) with its international reference value, namely corresponding the fieldbased mean citation score (FCSm) by calculating the ratio. It was developed by Anthony van Raan and the CWTS as a measure for the visibility of a department compared to an international standard. Self-citations are excluded in the calculation of the ratio to prevent the ratio from being affected by divergent self-citation behaviour.
If the ratio CPP/FCSm (= crown indicator) is above (or below) 1.0, this means that the papers of the research unit are cited more (or less) frequently than an 'average' publication in the field(s) in which the research unit is active. FCSm constitutes a worldwide field-specific average in a specific (combination of) field(s). In this way, one may obtain an indication of the international position of a research unit in terms of its impact compared to a world average. This world average is calculated for the total population of articles published in Cl journals assigned to a particular field. This indicator focuses on the "reception" impact of such a department in its scientific community. The universities with a citation index at least 1.1 received a star.

This indicator was chosen for both the 2009 and 2010 rounds.

## - Outstanding researchers

The "lighthouse" indicator
This indicator identifies institutions with outstanding researchers. Only researchers that are still teaching at the specific institution are counted. Nobel Prize winners, winners of the Körber European Science Award ${ }^{8}$ and field medallists in mathematics were taken into account. A star is granted to those universities with at least one outstanding researcher working in the respective field.

This indicator was chosen for the 2010 round.

[^2]- Number of projects in the Marie Curie programme ${ }^{9}$

The "European dimension" indicator
This indicator measures European activity. The Sixth and Seventh Framework Programme's Human Resources and Mobility (HRM) activity is largely based on the financing of training and mobility activities for researchers. These activities, known as the Marie Curie Actions, are aimed at the development and transfer of research competencies, the consolidation and widening of researchers' career prospects, and the promotion of excellence in European research.

Data were taken from the Cordis database of the European Commission. The following activity lines were taken into account:

- IEF Marie Curie Action: "Intra-European Fellowships for Career Development"
- IRG Marie Curie Action: "International Reintegration Grants"
- ITN Marie Curie Action: "Networks for Initial Training"
- ERG Marie Curie Action: "European Reintegration Grants"
- IAPP Marie Curie Action: "Industry-Academia Partnerships and Pathways"
- IOF Marie Curie Action: "International Outgoing Fellowships for Career Development"
- IIF Marie Curie Action: "International Incoming Fellowships"
- IRSES Marie Curie Action "International Research Staff Exchange Scheme"

This indicator highlights the European dimension of the departments. The method used to identify the stars was similar to the method used for grouping the publication indicator. In biology three points, in chemistry and physics two points were sufficient for a star. In mathematics a star was awarded if there was at least one Marie Curie project.

This indicator was chosen for the 2010 round.

## - Student mobility

The European mobility dimension
This indicator measures the mobility opportunities for postgraduate students and is at the same time a European component. A star is given to those institutions which have the largest student mobility and belong to the group which comprises of at least $80 \%$ (for sciences $50 \%$ ) of all cases counted here. In economics 35 students were sufficient for a star, in political science 30 and in psychology 16 students, in biology 26, in chemistry 36 , in mathematics 21 and in physics 20.

This indicator was chosen for both rounds.

- Teaching staff mobility

The European mobility and teaching dimension
Likewise, it was possible to analyse how many teachers were sent for compact teaching abroad periods within the ERASMUS programme. This indicator combines the European perspective with a teaching perspective. In addition, as teaching staff mobility (TS) is largely reciprocal, participating HEls are not only proving to be internationally active but usually also receive teaching staff from abroad, adding an international component to their studies.

[^3]RANKING

A star is given to those institutions which have the largest teaching staff mobility and belong to the group which comprises of at least $80 \%$ (sciences $50 \%$ ) of all cases counted here, the minimum number of teaching staff mobility to achieve a star was 3 for all three subjects in 2009, 4 for those in 2010.

This indicator was chosen for both rounds.

## - Erasmus-Mundus-Master ${ }^{10}$

The European Union offers financial support for selected master's programmes. These programmes have to pass a careful screening process and competition for these grants is strong. Programmes are usually very interdisciplinary and sometimes only one of the departments participating in an EM programme could be considered, as the others did not cover the academic fields under scrutiny. A star was allocated when a department could be identified as being a participating institution in an EM programme.

This indicator was chosen for both rounds.

## - ERC grants

The European Research Council, founded in 2005, supports researchers on two levels (starting, advanced) with substantial funding. Starting grants comprise up to 2 Mio $€$ while advanced grants can cover up to 3.5 Mio $€$, both for a maximum of 5 years. With this programme the EU is furthering high level research in various disciplines. For the current analysis the grants for 2007 and 2008 could be taken into account (the selections for 2009 were published too late for this analysis). The ERC provided us directly with the data. As it was considered to be equally prestigious to host such an elite scientist (particularly as the scientist him-/herself decides on the host institution) as it is to educate him/her or to be the original employer, both the sending and the receiving institution are granted a value. ${ }^{11}$

This indicator was chosen for the 2010 round.

## - Book citations

For the first time, an effort was made to try not only an analysis of the citation of articles, but also of books. CWTS Leiden undertook this endeavour as we were convinced that in the social science subjects analysed in 2009, books play a major role. Although it proved impossible to provide an analysis exactly comparable to article citations because of insufficiencies in the databases which are available, it was possible to identify a number of highly cited books which are considered highly relevant in the respective field. However, because of the scarceness of data, this indicator was not used as a self-reliant indicator but as a " + " indicator for the publication indicator.

This indicator was chosen for the 2009 round.

[^4]For the Excellence Group 2009 a minimum of one star of the two research-oriented indicators [publications (including highly cited books) or citations] and one additional star from one of the other three indicators (student mobility, teacher mobility, or ERASMUS MUNDUS) were required. Also in 2009, if a university managed to obtain three stars in the non-research based indicators, it became a member of the Excellence group. For 2010 two stars with on from publications or citations or three stars altogether were sufficient to become member of the Excellence Group.

### 3.2 In-Depth Analysis

In a second step, these institutions were analysed in-depth and presented in detail. Study conditions, programmes and other criteria were taken into consideration. The questionnaires were reviewed by the CHE and external partners at various stages of the process were consulted since 2007, omitting questions that could not be answered by most of the institutions as well as adding some new aspects.

In the next project phase, the data collected from the institutions and the information gathered from the (PhD and master's) student questionnaires were analysed and ranked, depending on the validity and completeness of the data (i.e. stars were assigned to the departments doing best in this indicator). Other data were presented without the assignment of stars.

Indicators fulfilling the following criteria were presented with assigned stars:

1. A sufficiently high percentage of institutions (at least $50 \%$ ) were able to provide reliable and dependable data.
2. The data provided could be considered comparable between countries within reasonable boundaries. For example, funding proved to be impossible as an indicator because budgeting systems varied too much; the calculation of staff costs and the level of detail that could be shared by the HEIs were also too diverse.
3. Student evaluations were only taken into account if the sample group size for each indicator was at least fifteen students.

As a result, for the following indicators, stars were assigned:

- students' judgements on the doctoral and master's levels, such as the overall situation, aspects of training and courses, counselling and advise, the computer equipment, the laboratories and the library. For doctoral students, more researchoriented aspects were judged, e.g., the possibility to take part in the scientific community by attending conferences or workshops and by publishing papers. the percentage of international staff within the group of staff with a doctorate. the percentage of international doctoral and master's students. the gender balance, i.e. the deviation from a 50/50-distribution regarding the staff, doctoral and master's students the number of subject-specific scientific journals available in the library on a subscription basis (either print or as e-journal) the number of memberships in editorial boards of major scientific journals per 10 members of the scientific staff the number of renowned scientific prizes won by staff members (political science only)
- the number of international conferences held or organised by the department in 5 recent years (political science only)
- the average percentage per year of scientific staff teaching in summer schools (political science only)

A central feature of the online version is the possibility to access the departments/faculties not only via a simple list of the excellence group departments but also via the research categories, one of the most valuable informative assets of the endeavour. Each department was asked to name their research groups and to assign them to one or more research categories. This allows for the option to search for a subfield of a subject and to identify those departments working on a student's own field of interest. More than 4,500 research groups were named by the departments. Prospective doctoral students are possibly less interested in the general performance of a faculty or department than in a specific research group. They usually have very clear ideas about the specialised topic on which they are focusing. Thus, it might be of some value for a student searching for a biology doctoral programme specialising in insects to know that the faculty at University $A$ is excellent in its research output in this domain. However, it might be much more interesting for this individual to learn that he could delve into "ethnobotany" at the Swedish Uppsala Universitet, or, a student in astrophysics might be attracted less by the overall performance of the Physics Department at the University Liverpool than by its research group focusing on "condensed matter". These are just two examples illustrating the particular added value of the in-depth analysis of the CHE ExcellenceRanking.

## 4 Results of the Preselection

In this section, the results of the preselection process (see section 3.1) are reported. At first on the level of the countries, then on the universities' level and finally for each of the seven subjects the ranking includes.

### 4.1 Country level

In the table below the number of departments from each country that made it into one of the Excellence Groups is shown, as well as the number of universities from each country with at least one "excellent" department. Regarding the number of departments the United Kingdom is leading the list, followed by Germany and The Netherlands.

Table 1: Number of departments and universities in the Excellence Group (aggregated for 2009 and 2010)

| Country | Departments | Universities |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| United Kingdom | 120 | 40 |
| Germany | 79 | 34 |
| The Netherlands | 41 | 12 |
| France | 35 | 18 |
| Italy | 29 | 13 |
| Spain | 29 | 13 |
| Sweden | 28 | 10 |
| Switzerland | 22 | 8 |
| Belgium | 16 | 6 |
| Denmark | 12 | 3 |
| Austria | 10 | 6 |
| Finland | 7 | 2 |
| Poland | 6 | 4 |
| Czech Republic | 5 | 2 |
| Hungary | 4 | 3 |
| Ireland | 4 | 3 |
| Norway | 3 | 2 |
| Portugal | 1 | 1 |
| Estonia | 1 | 1 |

The next table shows the distribution of the Excellence Group-placements for each country according to subject areas. Again, the United Kingdom is taking the lead, except for the Mathematics and Physics, where Germany could place the most departments in the Excellence Group.

Table 2: Distribution of departments according to subjects across countries

| Country | Departments <br> total | Biology | Chemistry | Economics | Mathematics | Physics | Political <br> Science | Psychology |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| United <br> Kingdom | 120 | 21 | 13 | 23 | 9 | 11 | 21 | 22 |
| Germany | 79 | 15 | 12 | 7 | 11 | 16 | 8 | 10 |
| The <br> Netherlands | 41 | 7 | 7 | 7 | 3 | 6 | 2 | 9 |
| France | 35 | 8 | 7 | 5 | 6 | 6 |  | 3 |
| Italy | 29 | 2 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 8 | 3 | 3 |
| Spain | 29 | 1 | 8 | 7 | 5 | 5 | 1 | 2 |
| Sweden | 28 | 6 | 5 | 3 | 3 | 5 | 2 | 4 |


| Country | Departments <br> total | Biology | Chemistry | Economics | Mathematics | Physics | Political <br> Science | Psychology |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Switzerland | 22 | 7 | 2 | 3 | 2 | 4 | 3 | 1 |
| Belgium | 16 | 2 | 1 | 4 | 2 | 2 | 2 |  |
| Denmark | 12 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 2 |  |
| Austria | 10 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 5 | 2 |  |  |
| Finland | 7 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 |  |
| Poland | 6 |  | 4 |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |
| Czech <br> Republic | 5 |  |  | 2 | 1 |  | 2 |  |
| Ireland | 4 | 4 | 1 |  | 2 |  |  |  |
| Hungary | 3 |  |  | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 |  |
| Norway | 3 | 1 |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |
| Estonia | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| Portugal | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |

Figure 1: Distribution of departments according to subjects across countries

### 4.2 Findings on the University Level

### 4.2.1 Distribution of Excellence Group Placements across Universities

Figure 2 shows the percentages of universities excelling in only one subject, two subjects, and so on. Sixty-six (i.e. $37 \%$ ) of the 181 universities included in the ranking excelled in only one of the surveyed subjects, another 49 ( $27 \%$ ) of the universities excelled in two subjects. Twenty-three (13\%) of the universities excelled in three subjects and another 21 (12\%) of the universities in four subjects. Excellence in five fields was only reached by $10(6 \%)$ of the universities; five (3\%) achieved the status in six fields and seven (4\%) universities were able to reach the Excellence Group in all seven fields: Universiteit can Amsterdam, University of Bristol, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, University College London/University of London, University of Manchester, Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München, University of Oxford.

Figure 2: Percentages of number of placements in the Excellence Group per university


Table 3 shows the distribution of the Excellence Group placements across all the universities in the ranking.

Table 3: Distribution of excellence group placements across universities

| University | Number of fields in the Excellence Group | 䓯 | - 근 |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 首 } \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { U } \\ & \stackrel{0}{\pi} \\ & \tilde{\pi} \\ & 0 \\ & \frac{\pi}{\pi} \\ & \Sigma \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \frac{n}{0} \\ & \frac{0}{n} \\ & \frac{\lambda}{n} \end{aligned}$ |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Universiteit van Amsterdam | 7 | NE | X | x | X | X | X | X | - |


| University | Number of fields in the Excellence Group |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { तो } \\ & \frac{0}{0} \\ & \frac{0}{0} \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{\|l} \frac{\lambda}{U} \\ \frac{\ddots}{E} \\ \frac{0}{U} \\ \frac{U}{U} \\ \hline \end{array}$ | 告 |  | $\begin{aligned} & \frac{0}{3} \\ & \frac{0}{n} \\ & \frac{त}{2} \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 즌 } \\ & \frac{0}{0} \\ & \frac{1}{0} \\ & \text { র } \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| University of Bristol | 7 | UK | X | X | X | X | X | X | X |
| Katholieke Universiteit Leuven | 7 | BE | X | X | X | X | $x$ | X | $x$ |
| University College London, University of London | 7 | UK | X | X | X | X | X | X | X |
| University of Manchester | 7 | UK | X | X | X | X | X | X | X |
| Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München | 7 | DE | X | X | X | X | X | X | X |
| University of Oxford | 7 | UK | X | X | X | X | X | X | X |
| Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin | 6 | DE | X |  | X | X | X | X | X |
| University of Cambridge | 6 | UK | X | X | X | X | X |  | X |
| Helsingin Yliopisto | 6 | FI | X | X |  | X | X | X | X |
| Københavns Universitet | 6 | DK | X | X | X | X | X | X |  |
| Uppsala Universitet | 6 | SE | X | X |  | X | X | X | X |
| Universitat de Barcelona | 5 | ES |  | X | X | X | X |  | X |
| The University of Birmingham | 5 | UK | X |  | X |  | X | X | X |
| University of Edinburgh | 5 | UK | X | X |  | X | X |  | X |
| Albert-Ludwigs-Universität Freiburg | 5 | DE | X | X | $x$ | X |  |  | $x$ |
| Rijksuniversiteit Groningen | 5 | NE | X | X | X |  | X |  | X |
| Ruprecht-Karls-Universität Heidelberg | 5 | DE | X | X |  | X | X |  | X |
| Universiteit Leiden | 5 | NE | X | X |  |  | X | X | X |
| Lunds Universitet | 5 | SE | X | X | X | X | X |  |  |
| University of Sheffield | 5 | UK | X | X | X |  |  | X | X |
| Universiteit Utrecht | 5 | NE | X | X |  | X | X |  | X |
| Aarhus Universitet | 4 | DK | X |  |  | X | X | X |  |
| Universitat Autonoma de Barcelona | 4 | ES | X | X | X | X |  |  |  |
| Freie Universität Berlin | 4 | DE | X | X |  |  | X | X |  |
| Università di Bologna | 4 | IT |  | X | X |  |  | X | X |
| University of Glasgow | 4 | UK | X |  |  | X |  | X | X |
| École Polytechnique Fédérale de Lausanne | 4 | CH | X | X |  | X | X |  |  |
| University of Leeds | 4 | UK |  | X | X |  |  | X | X |
| University of Liverpool | 4 | UK | X | X |  |  | X |  | X |
| Imperial College London | 4 | UK | X | X |  | X | X |  |  |
| Université catholique de Louvain | 4 | BE |  |  | X | X |  | X | X |
| Universidad Complutense de Madrid | 4 | ES |  | X | X | X | X |  |  |
| Radboud Universiteit Nijmegen | 4 | NE | X | X |  |  | X |  | X |
| The University of Nottingham | 4 | UK | X | X | X |  |  | X |  |
| Università degli Studi di Padova | 4 | IT | X |  |  | X | X |  | X |
| Université Paris-Sud 11 | 4 | FR | X | X |  | X | X |  |  |
| Université Pierre et Marie Curie | 4 | FR | X | X |  | X | X |  |  |
| The University of Warwick | 4 | UK |  |  | X | X |  | X | X |
| Universität Wien | 4 | AT | X |  | X | X | X |  |  |
| The University of York | 4 | UK | X |  | X |  |  | X | X |
| Eidgenössisch Technische Hochschule Zürich | 4 | CH | X | X |  | X | X |  |  |


| University | Number of fields in the Excellence Group | 䓔 | - |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { U } \\ & \underline{E} \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & \tilde{U} \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ |  | $\begin{aligned} & \frac{n}{2} \\ & \frac{0}{n} \\ & \frac{\pi}{2} \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Universität Zürich | 4 | CH | X |  | X |  |  | X | X |
| Rheinisch-Westfälische Technische Hochschule Aachen | 3 | DE |  | X |  | X | X |  |  |
| University of Aberdeen • King's College | 3 | UK | X |  | X |  |  |  | X |
| Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam | 3 | NE | X |  | X |  |  |  | X |
| Universität Bern | 3 | CH | X |  | X |  |  | X |  |
| Cardiff University | 3 | UK | X |  |  |  |  | X | X |
| Technische Universiteit Delft | 3 | NE |  | X |  | X | X |  |  |
| University of Essex | 3 | UK |  |  | X |  |  | X | X |
| Johann Wolfgang Goethe-Universität Frankfurt | 3 | DE | X |  |  |  | X | X |  |
| Göteborgs Universitet | 3 | SE | X |  |  |  |  | X | X |
| Universität Hamburg | 3 | DE | X | X |  |  | X |  |  |
| Friedrich-Schiller-Universität Jena | 3 | DE |  |  |  |  | X | X | X |
| Universidad Autónoma de Madrid | 3 | ES |  | X |  | X | X |  |  |
| Philipps-Universität Marburg | 3 | DE | X | X |  |  |  |  | X |
| Technische Universität München | 3 | DE | X | X |  |  | X |  |  |
| Newcastle University | 3 | UK | X |  | X |  |  | X |  |
| Université Paris 7 - Denis Diderot | 3 | FR | X |  |  | X | X |  |  |
| Univerzita Karlova v Praze | 3 | CZ |  |  | X | X |  | X |  |
| KTH Kungliga Tekniska Högskolan Stockholms | 3 | SE |  | X |  | X | X |  |  |
| Universitet Stockholms | 3 | SE | X | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of Sussex | 3 | UK |  |  | X |  |  | X | X |
| Université Paul Sabatier | 3 | FR | X |  |  | X | X |  |  |
| Universitat de València | 3 | ES |  | X |  |  | X |  | X |
| Bayerische Julius-Maximilians-Universität Würzburg | 3 | DE | X |  |  |  | X |  | X |
| Universitat Pompeu Fabra | 2 | ES |  |  | X |  |  | X |  |
| Universität Basel | 2 | CH | X |  |  |  | X |  |  |
| University of Bath | 2 | UK |  |  | X |  |  |  | X |
| Universität Bielefeld | 2 | DE |  |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Rheinische Friedrich-Wilhelms-Universität Bonn | 2 | DE |  |  |  | X | X |  |  |
| Eötvös Loránd University Tudományegyetem | 2 | HU |  |  |  | X | X |  |  |
| University College Dublin, National University of Ireland | 2 | IE | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Durham University Science Laboratories | 2 | UK |  | X |  |  | X |  |  |
| Friedrich-Alexander-Universität Erlangen-Nürnberg | 2 | DE |  | X |  |  | X |  |  |
| Université de Geneve | 2 | CH | X |  |  |  | X |  |  |
| Universiteit Gent | 2 | BE | X |  |  |  |  |  | X |
| Chalmers Tekniska Högskola | 2 | SE |  | X |  |  | X |  |  |
| Université Joseph Fourier Grenoble | 2 | FR |  | X |  |  | X |  |  |
| Uniwersytet Jagiellonski | 2 | PL |  | X |  |  |  | X |  |
| Universität Karlsruhe | 2 | DE |  | X |  |  | X |  |  |
| Universität Konstanz | 2 | DE |  |  |  |  |  | X | X |
| University of Lancaster | 2 | UK |  |  | X |  |  | X |  |


| University | Number of fields in the Excellence Group | * | 증 |  | O |  | $\begin{aligned} & \frac{\pi}{2} \\ & \frac{0}{n} \\ & \frac{\pi}{2} \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ |  | $\begin{aligned} & \frac{\pi}{0} \\ & \frac{0}{0} \\ & \frac{0}{0} \\ & \vdots \\ & \vdots \end{aligned}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| University of Lausanne | 2 | CH | X |  |  |  |  | X |  |
| King's College London | 2 | UK | X |  |  |  |  |  | X |
| London School of Economics and Political Science | 2 | UK |  |  | X |  |  | X |  |
| Danmarks Tekniske Universitet | 2 | DK | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |
| Université Claude Bernard Lyon 1 | 2 | FR | X |  |  |  | X |  |  |
| Universiteit Maastricht | 2 | NE |  |  | X |  |  |  | X |
| Johannes Gutenberg-Universität Mainz | 2 | DE |  | X |  |  | X |  |  |
| Università degli Studi di Milano | 2 | IT | X |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| Université Montpellier 2 | 2 | FR | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |
| Westfälische Wilhelms-Universität Münster | 2 | DE | X |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| Università degli Studi di Napoli Federico II | 2 | IT |  | X |  |  | X |  |  |
| Universitetet i Oslo | 2 | NO | X |  |  |  |  | X |  |
| L'Université Paris Descartes | 2 | FR | X |  |  |  |  |  | X |
| Università di Pisa | 2 | IT |  | X |  |  | X |  |  |
| Vysoká škola ekonomická v Praze | 2 | CZ |  |  | X |  |  | X |  |
| University of Reading | 2 | UK | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Université de Rennes 1 | 2 | FR |  | X |  | X |  |  |  |
| Università degli Studi di Roma La Sapienza | 2 | IT |  |  |  |  | X |  | X |
| Università di Roma Tor Vergata | 2 | IT |  |  |  | X | X |  |  |
| Erasmus University Rotterdam | 2 | NE |  |  | X |  |  |  | X |
| University of Southampton | 2 | UK |  | X |  |  |  |  | X |
| Karolinska Institutet | 2 | SE | X |  |  |  |  |  | X |
| Université de Strasbourg | 2 | FR | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |
| University of Strathclyde | 2 | UK |  |  | X |  |  | X |  |
| Universität Stuttgart | 2 | DE |  | X |  |  | X |  |  |
| Université Bordeaux 1 | 2 | FR |  | X |  | X |  |  |  |
| Universiteit van Tilburg | 2 | NE |  |  | X |  |  |  | X |
| Università degli Studi di Torino | 2 | IT |  | X |  |  | X |  |  |
| Eberhard Karls Universität Tübingen | 2 | DE | X |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| Wageningen Universiteit | 2 | NE | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Uniwersytet Warszawski | 2 | PL |  | X |  |  | X |  |  |
| Technische Universität Wien | 2 | AT |  |  |  | X | X |  |  |
| Aberystwyth University | 1 | UK |  |  |  |  |  | X |  |
| Université de Provence - Aix Marseille I | 1 | FR |  |  |  |  |  |  | X |
| Bangor University | 1 | UK |  |  |  |  |  |  | X |
| Universitat Politècnica de Catalunya | 1 | ES |  |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| Queen's University Belfast | 1 | UK |  |  |  |  |  | X |  |
| Technische Universität Berlin | 1 | DE |  |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| Universita' Commerciale Luigi Bocconi Milano | 1 | IT |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Vrije Universiteit Brussel | 1 | BE |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Université Libre de Bruxelles | 1 | BE |  |  |  |  | X |  |  |


| University | Number of fields in the Excellence Group | 䓯 |  | $\begin{array}{\|c} \frac{Z}{U} \\ \stackrel{U}{E} \\ \frac{0}{U} \\ \hline \end{array}$ |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { U } \\ & .0 \\ & \stackrel{\pi}{\pi} \\ & \frac{\pi}{0} \\ & \frac{\pi}{\pi} \\ & \Sigma \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \frac{n}{n} \\ & \frac{0}{n} \\ & \frac{\pi}{2} \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ |  | 甬 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Budapesti Corvinus Egyetem | 1 | HU |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Central European University | 1 | HU |  |  |  |  |  | X |  |
| Universidad de Cantabria | 1 | ES |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Universidade de Coimbra | 1 | PT |  |  |  |  |  |  | X |
| Technische Universität Darmstadt | 1 | DE |  |  |  |  |  | X |  |
| University of Dublin, Trinity College | 1 | IE |  |  |  |  |  | X |  |
| University of Dundee | 1 | UK | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Heinrich-Heine-Universität Düsseldorf | 1 | DE | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| University of East Anglia | 1 | UK |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Heriot-Watt University Edinburgh | 1 | UK |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Technische Universiteit Eindhoven | 1 | NE |  | X |  |  |  |  |  |
| University of Exeter | 1 | UK | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| European University Institute | 1 | IT |  |  |  |  |  | X |  |
| Università degli Studi di Firenze | 1 | IT |  |  |  |  | X |  |  |
| Georg-August-Universität Göttingen | 1 | DE | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Universidad de Granada | 1 | ES |  |  |  |  | X |  |  |
| Technische Universität Graz | 1 | AT |  |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| Leopold-Franzens-Universität Innsbruck | 1 | AT |  | X |  |  |  |  |  |
| University of Joensuu | 1 | FI |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Technische Universität Kaiserslautern | 1 | DE |  |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| Christian-Albrechts-Universität zu Kiel | 1 | DE | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Universität zu Köln | 1 | DE |  |  |  |  | X |  |  |
| Universität Leipzig | 1 | DE |  |  |  |  |  |  | X |
| Université des Sciences et Technologies de Lille U.S.T.L. | 1 | FR |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of Limerick | 1 | IE |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Johannes Kepler Universität Linz | 1 | AT |  |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| Loughborough University | 1 | UK |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Leuphana Universität Lüneburg | 1 | DE |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Université Lumière Lyon 2 | 1 | FR |  |  |  |  |  |  | X |
| Universidad Carlos III de Madrid | 1 | ES |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Universidad Politécnica de Madrid | 1 | ES |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Universität Mannheim | 1 | DE |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Facultés Universitaires Notre-Dame de la Paix | 1 | BE |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Örebro universitet | 1 | SE |  |  |  |  |  |  | X |
| Universidad del País Vasco | 1 | ES |  | X |  |  |  |  |  |
| Université Paris-Dauphine | 1 | FR |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Université Paris 1 Panthéon Sorbonne | 1 | FR |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Université Paris-Nord 13 | 1 | FR |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of Plymouth | 1 | UK | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Universität Potsdam | 1 | DE |  |  |  |  |  | X |  |
| Uniwersytet im. Adama Mickiewicza w Poznaniu | 1 | PL |  | X |  |  |  |  |  |


| University | Number of fields in the Excellence Group | 䓔 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 긍 } \\ & \frac{\circ}{\circ} \\ & \text { 응 } \end{aligned}$ |  |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \frac{n}{2} \\ & \frac{0}{n} \\ & \frac{\pi}{2} \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ |  | $\begin{array}{\|l} \text { 증 } \\ \frac{0}{0} \\ \frac{0}{0} \\ \vdots \\ n \\ \hline \end{array}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| University of Salford | 1 | UK |  |  |  |  |  | X |  |
| Universität St. Gallen | 1 | CH |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of St Andrews | 1 | UK |  |  |  |  | X |  |  |
| Handelshögskolan i Stockholm | 1 | SE |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of Sunderland | 1 | UK |  |  |  |  |  |  | X |
| Tartu Ülikool | 1 | EE |  |  |  |  |  | X |  |
| Politecnico de Torino | 1 | IT |  |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| Université Toulouse 1 | 1 | FR |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Universität Trier | 1 | DE |  |  |  |  |  |  | X |
| Università degli Studi di Trieste | 1 | IT |  |  |  |  | X |  |  |
| Norges Teknisk-Naturvitenskapelige Universitet | 1 | NO |  |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| Sveriges Lantbruksuniversitet | 1 | SE | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Medizinische Universität Wien | 1 | AT |  |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| Wroclaw Uniwersytet | 1 | PL |  | X |  |  |  |  |  |
| Bergische Universität Wuppertal | 1 | DE |  |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Universidad de Zaragoza | 1 | ES |  | X |  |  |  |  |  |

*Legend: AT=Austria; BE=Belgium; CH=Switzerland; CZ=Czech Republic; DE=Germany; DK=Denmark; EE=Estonia; ES=Spain; FI=Finland; FR=France; HU=Hungary; IE=Ireland; IT=Italy; NE=The Netherlands;
NO=Norway; PL=Poland; PT=Portugal; SE=Sweden; UK=United Kingdom

### 4.3 Findings for the Single Subjects

For each of the seven subjects included in the ranking similar tables and figures are shown here: An overview of the distribution of "stars" gathered by the departments in the preselection (i.e. not the institutional and students's survey), the distribution of stars across the different preselection criteria as well as - of course - the list of the departments that made it into the Excellence Group in the respective subject.

### 4.3.1 Biology (2010)

Table 4: Stars Table Biology

| Country | Stars | Universi <br> ties |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| United Kingdom | 67 | 21 |
| Germany | 51 | 15 |
| The Netherlands | 24 | 7 |
| Switzerland | 23 | 7 |
| Sweden | 21 | 6 |
| France | 20 | 8 |
| Denmark | 11 | 3 |
| Belgium | 6 | 2 |
| Spain | 5 | 1 |
| Italy | 5 | 2 |
| Ireland | 4 | 1 |
| Finland | 4 | 1 |
| Austria | 4 | 1 |
| Norway | 2 | 1 |

Figure 3: Star distribution across countries in Biology


Legend: AT=Austria; BE=Belgium; CH=Switzerland; CZ=Czech Republic; DE=Germany; DK=Denmark; EE=Estonia; ES=Spain; FI=Finland; FR=France; HU=Hungary; IE=Ireland; IT=Italy; NE=The Netherlands; NO=Norway; PL=Poland; PT=Portugal; SE=Sweden; UK=United Kingdom

Table 5: Excellence Group Biology

| University | Z İ 0 0 |  | $n$ 0 0 0 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Aarhus Universitet | DK | X | X |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| University of Aberdeen • King's College | UK | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Universiteit van Amsterdam | NE | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam | NE | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Universitat Autonoma de Barcelona | ES | X | X |  | X | X | X |  |  |
| Universität Basel | CH | X | X |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| Freie Universität Berlin | DE | X |  | X |  |  | X |  | X |
| Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin | DE | X | X |  | X | X |  |  | X |
| Universität Bern | CH | X | X |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| The University of Birmingham | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| University of Bristol | UK | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of Cambridge | UK | X | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Cardiff University | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| University College Dublin, National University of Ireland | IE | X | X |  | X |  |  |  | X |
| University of Dundee | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Heinrich-Heine-Universität Düsseldorf | DE | X | X |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| University of Edinburgh | UK | X | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| University of Exeter | UK |  | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Johann Wolfgang Goethe-Universität Frankfurt | DE | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Albert-Ludwigs-Universität Freiburg | DE | X | X |  |  |  |  |  | X |
| Université de Geneve | CH | X | X |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| Universiteit Gent | BE | X | X |  |  |  |  |  | X |
| University of Glasgow | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Göteborgs Universitet | SE | X | X |  | X |  |  | X |  |
| Georg-August-Universität Göttingen | DE | X | X |  |  |  | X |  | X |
| Rijksuniversiteit Groningen | NE | X | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Universität Hamburg | DE | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Ruprecht-Karls-Universität Heidelberg | DE | X | X |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| Helsingin Yliopisto | FI | X | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Christian-Albrechts-Universität zu Kiel | DE | X | X |  | X |  |  |  | X |
| Københavns Universitet | DK | X | X |  | X | X |  |  | X |
| École Polytechnique Fédérale de Lausanne | CH |  | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| University of Lausanne | CH | X | X |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| Universiteit Leiden | NE | X | X |  |  |  |  |  | X |
| Katholieke Universiteit Leuven | BE | X | X |  |  |  |  |  | X |
| University of Liverpool | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Imperial College London | UK | X | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| King's College London | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| University College London, University of London | UK | X | X | X | X | X |  |  | X |
| Lunds Universitet | SE | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Danmarks Tekniske Universitet | DK | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Université Claude Bernard Lyon 1 | FR | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of Manchester | UK | X | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |
| Philipps-Universität Marburg | DE | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Università degli Studi di Milano | IT | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Université Montpellier 2 | FR | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München | DE | X | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Technische Universität München | DE | X | X |  | X | X |  |  | X |


| University | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & \text { In } \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ |  |  |  |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Z } \\ & \text { 2 } \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Westfälische Wilhelms-Universität Münster | DE | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Newcastle University | UK |  | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Radboud Universiteit Nijmegen | NE | X | X |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| The University of Nottingham | UK | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Universitetet i Oslo | NO | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| University of Oxford | UK | X | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Università degli Studi di Padova | IT | X |  |  |  |  | X |  | X |
| L'Université Paris Descartes | FR | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Université Paris-Sud 11 | FR | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Université Pierre et Marie Curie | FR | X | X |  | X | X |  |  | X |
| Université Paris 7 - Denis Diderot | FR | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| University of Plymouth | UK |  | X |  |  | X |  |  | X |
| University of Reading | UK | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of Sheffield | UK | X | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Karolinska Institutet | SE | X | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Universitet Stockholms | SE | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Université de Strasbourg | FR |  | X |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| Université Paul Sabatier | FR | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Eberhard Karls Universität Tübingen | DE | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Sveriges Lantbruksuniversitet | SE | X | X |  |  |  |  |  | X |
| Uppsala Universitet | SE | X | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Universiteit Utrecht | NE | X | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Wageningen Universiteit | NE | X | X |  | X |  |  |  | X |
| Universität Wien | AT | X | X |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| Bayerische Julius-Maximilians-Universität Würzburg | DE | X | X | X |  |  | X |  |  |
| The University of York | UK | X | X | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Eidgenössisch Technische Hochschule Zürich | CH | X | X | X | X | X |  |  |  |
| Universität Zürich | CH | X | X |  |  | X |  |  |  |

### 4.3.2 Chemistry (2010)

Table 6: Stars Table Chemistry

| Country | Stars | Universities |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| United Kingdom | 42 | 13 |
| Germany | 38 | 12 |
| The Netherlands | 27 | 7 |
| Spain | 23 | 7 |
| France | 23 | 7 |
| Sweden | 17 | 5 |
| Poland | 12 | 4 |
| Italy | 11 | 4 |
| Switzerland | 8 | 2 |
| Belgium | 5 | 1 |
| Denmark | 4 | 2 |
| Finland | 3 | 1 |
| Austria | 3 | 1 |

Figure 4: Star distribution across countries in Chemistry


Legend: AT=Austria; BE=Belgium; CH=Switzerland; CZ=Czech Republic; DE=Germany; DK=Denmark; EE=Estonia; ES=Spain; FI=Finland; FR=France; HU=Hungary; IE=Ireland; IT=Italy; NE=The Netherlands; NO=Norway; PL=Poland; PT=Portugal; SE=Sweden; UK=United Kingdom

Table 7: Excellence Group Chemistry

| University | İ ご $\vdots$ 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Rheinisch-Westfälische Technische Hochschule Aachen | DE | X | X | X | X |  | X |  |  |
| Universiteit van Amsterdam | NE | X | X |  | X | X |  |  | X |
| Universitat Autonoma de Barcelona | ES |  |  |  | X |  | X |  | X |
| Universitat de Barcelona | ES | X | X |  |  |  | X |  | X |
| Freie Universität Berlin | DE | X |  |  |  |  | X |  | X |
| Università di Bologna | IT | X | X |  | X |  |  |  | X |
| University of Bristol | UK | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of Cambridge | UK | X | X | X | X | X |  |  |  |
| Technische Universiteit Delft | NE | X | X |  | X |  |  |  | X |
| Durham University Science Laboratories | UK | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of Edinburgh | UK |  | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Technische Universiteit Eindhoven | NE | X | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Friedrich-Alexander-Universität Erlangen-Nürnberg | DE | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Albert-Ludwigs-Universität Freiburg | DE | X | X |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| Chalmers Tekniska Högskola | SE | X | X |  | X |  |  |  | X |
| Université Joseph Fourier Grenoble | FR | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Rijksuniversiteit Groningen | NE |  | X | X | X | X |  |  |  |
| Universität Hamburg | DE | X | X |  |  |  | X |  |  |
| Ruprecht-Karls-Universität Heidelberg | DE | X | X |  |  | X | X |  |  |
| Helsingin Yliopisto | FI | X | X |  |  |  |  |  | X |
| Leopold-Franzens-Universität Innsbruck | AT |  | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Uniwersytet Jagiellonski | PL | X |  |  |  |  | X |  | X |
| Universität Karlsruhe | DE | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Københavns Universitet | DK | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| École Polytechnique Fédérale de Lausanne | CH | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of Leeds | UK | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Universiteit Leiden | NE | X | X |  | X |  |  |  | X |
| Katholieke Universiteit Leuven | BE | X | X |  | X | X |  |  | X |
| University of Liverpool | UK |  | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Imperial College London | UK | X | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| University College London, University of London | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Lunds Universitet | SE | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Danmarks Tekniske Universitet | DK | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Universidad Autónoma de Madrid | ES | X | X |  |  |  | X |  |  |
| Universidad Complutense de Madrid | ES | X |  |  |  |  | X |  | X |
| Johannes Gutenberg-Universität Mainz | DE | X | X |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| University of Manchester | UK | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Philipps-Universität Marburg | DE | X | X |  |  |  | X |  |  |
| Université Montpellier 2 | FR | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München | DE | X | X |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| Technische Universität München | DE | X | X |  |  |  | X |  |  |
| Università degli Studi di Napoli Federico II | $1 T$ | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Radboud Universiteit Nijmegen | NE |  | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| The University of Nottingham | UK | X | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| University of Oxford | UK | X | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Universidad del País Vasco | ES | X |  |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| Université Paris-Sud 11 | FR | X | X |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| Université Pierre et Marie Curie | FR | X | X |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| Università di Pisa | IT | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |


| University | 2 <br>  <br> $\vdots$ <br> 0 <br> 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Uniwersytet im. Adama Mickiewicza w Poznaniu | PL | X |  |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| Université de Rennes 1 | FR | X | X |  |  |  |  | X | X |
| University of Sheffield | UK | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of Southampton | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| KTH Kungliga Tekniska Högskolan Stockholms | SE | X | X |  | X |  |  |  | X |
| Universitet Stockholms | SE | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Université de Strasbourg | FR |  | X | X |  |  | X |  |  |
| Universität Stuttgart | DE | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Université Bordeaux 1 | FR | X | X |  | X |  |  |  | X |
| Università degli Studi di Torino | IT | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Uppsala Universitet | SE | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Universiteit Utrecht | NE | X | X |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| Universitat de València | ES | X | X |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| Uniwersytet Warszawski | PL | X |  |  | X |  |  | X |  |
| Wroclaw Uniwersytet | PL | X |  |  |  |  |  | X | X |
| Universidad de Zaragoza | ES | X |  |  |  |  | X | X |  |
| Eidgenössisch Technische Hochschule Zürich | CH | X | X | X | X | X |  |  |  |

### 4.3.3 Economics (2009)

Table 8: Stars Table Economics

| Country | Stars | Universities |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| United Kingdom | 54 | 23 |
| The Netherlands | 23 | 7 |
| Spain | 21 | 7 |
| Germany | 18 | 7 |
| France | 13 | 5 |
| Switzerland | 9 | 3 |
| Belgium | 8 | 4 |
| Czech Republic | 7 | 2 |
| Sweden | 6 | 3 |
| Italy | 5 | 2 |
| Ireland | 4 | 2 |
| Hungary | 3 | 1 |
| Finland | 2 | 1 |
| Denmark | 2 | 1 |
| Austria | 2 | 1 |

Figure 5: Star distribution across countries in Economics


Legend: AT=Austria; BE=Belgium; CH=Switzerland; CZ=Czech Republic; DE=Germany; DK=Denmark; EE=Estonia; ES=Spain; FI=Finland; FR=France; HU=Hungary; IE=Ireland; IT=Italy; NE=The Netherlands; NO=Norway; PL=Poland; PT=Portugal; SE=Sweden; UK=United Kingdom

Table 9: Excellence Group Economics

| University | $\begin{aligned} & \text { a } \\ & \vdots \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| University of Aberdeen • King's College | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Universiteit van Amsterdam | NE | X | X | X | X |  |  |
| Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam | NE | X | X | X |  |  |  |
| Universitat Autonoma de Barcelona | ES | X |  | X | X | X |  |
| Universitat de Barcelona | ES |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Universitat Pompeu Fabra | ES | X | X | X | X |  |  |
| University of Bath | UK | X | X |  | X |  |  |
| Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin | DE | X |  | X | X | X |  |
| Universität Bern | CH |  | X | X | X |  |  |
| Universität Bielefeld | DE |  |  | X | X | X |  |
| The University of Birmingham | UK | X |  |  |  |  | X |
| Universita' Commerciale Luigi Bocconi Milano | IT | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Università di Bologna | IT | X |  |  | X | X |  |
| University of Bristol | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Vrije Universiteit Brussel | BE |  | X |  |  | X |  |
| Budapesti Corvinus Egyetem | HU |  |  | X | X | X |  |
| University of Cambridge | UK | X | X |  |  |  | X |
| Universidad de Cantabria | ES |  |  | X | X | X |  |
| University College Dublin, National University of Ireland | IE |  | X |  |  | X |  |
| University of East Anglia | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Heriot-Watt University Edinburgh | UK |  | X |  |  | X |  |
| University of Essex | UK | X | X |  | X |  |  |
| Albert-Ludwigs-Universität Freiburg | DE |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Rijksuniversiteit Groningen | NE | X | X | X |  |  |  |
| University of Joensuu | FI |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| Københavns Universitet | DK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of Lancaster | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of Leeds | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Katholieke Universiteit Leuven | BE | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Université des Sciences et Technologies de Lille U.S.T.L. | FR |  |  | X | X | X |  |
| University of Limerick | IE |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| London School of Economics and Political Science | UK | X | X |  |  |  | X |
| University College London, University of London | UK | X | X |  |  | X |  |
| Loughborough University | UK | X |  |  | X |  |  |
| Université catholique de Louvain | BE | X |  | X |  |  |  |
| Lunds Universitet | SE |  | X |  |  | X |  |
| Leuphana Universität Lüneburg | DE |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| Universiteit Maastricht | NE | X | X | X |  |  | X |
| Universidad Complutense de Madrid | ES |  |  | X | X | X |  |
| Universidad Carlos III de Madrid | ES | X |  | X | X |  |  |
| Universidad Politécnica de Madrid | ES |  | X |  |  | X |  |
| University of Manchester | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Universität Mannheim | DE | X | X | X |  |  |  |
| Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München | DE | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Facultés Universitaires Notre-Dame de la Paix | BE |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Newcastle University | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| The University of Nottingham | UK | X | X |  | X |  |  |
| University of Oxford | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Université Paris-Dauphine | FR |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| Université Paris 1 Panthéon Sorbonne | FR | X |  | X |  | X |  |
| Université Paris-Nord 13 | FR |  | X |  | X |  |  |


| University | 式 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Univerzita Karlova v Praze | CZ | X |  | X | X | X |  |
| Vysoká škola ekonomická v Praze | CZ | X |  | X |  | X |  |
| University of Reading | UK | X |  |  | X |  |  |
| Erasmus University Rotterdam | NE | X | X |  |  | X |  |
| Universität St. Gallen | CH |  | X | X | X |  |  |
| University of Sheffield | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Handelshögskolan i Stockholm | SE | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Universitet Stockholms | SE | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of Strathclyde | UK | X | X |  |  | X |  |
| University of Sussex | UK | X | X |  | X |  |  |
| Universiteit van Tilburg | NE | X | X |  |  | X |  |
| Université Toulouse 1 | FR | X | X | X |  |  |  |
| Wageningen Universiteit | NE | X | X |  |  | X |  |
| The University of Warwick | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Universität Wien | AT | X |  |  |  | X |  |
| Bergische Universität Wuppertal | DE |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| The University of York | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Universität Zürich | CH |  | X | X | X |  |  |

### 4.3.4 Mathematics (2010)

Table 10: Stars Table Mathematics

| Country | Stars | Universities |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Germany | 38 | 11 |
| United Kingdom | 32 | 9 |
| France | 18 | 6 |
| Austria | 18 | 5 |
| Spain | 17 | 5 |
| Italy | 14 | 4 |
| Sweden | 9 | 3 |
| The Netherlands | 7 | 3 |
| Switzerland | 7 | 2 |
| Belgium | 7 | 2 |
| Denmark | 6 | 2 |
| Hungary | 4 | 1 |
| Finland | 4 | 1 |
| Czech Republic | 4 | 1 |
| Norway | 3 | 1 |

Figure 6: Star distribution across countries in Mathematics


Legend: AT=Austria; BE=Belgium; CH=Switzerland; CZ=Czech Republic; DE=Germany; DK=Denmark; EE=Estonia; ES=Spain; FI=Finland; FR=France; HU=Hungary; IE=Ireland; IT=Italy; NE=The Netherlands; NO=Norway; PL=Poland; PT=Portugal; SE=Sweden; UK=United Kingdom

Table 11: Excellence Group Mathematics

| University | 2 $\vdots$ $\vdots$ 0 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Rheinisch-Westfälische Technische Hochschule Aachen | DE | X | X |  |  |  | X |  | X |
| Aarhus Universitet | DK |  | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Universiteit van Amsterdam | NE | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Universitat Autonoma de Barcelona | ES | X |  |  |  |  |  | X | X |
| Universitat de Barcelona | ES | X | X |  |  |  | X |  |  |
| Universitat Politècnica de Catalunya | ES | X | X |  |  |  | X | X | X |
| Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin | DE | X | X |  | X |  | X | X |  |
| Technische Universität Berlin | DE | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Universität Bielefeld | DE | X | X |  |  |  | X |  | X |
| Rheinische Friedrich-Wilhelms-Universität Bonn | DE | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of Bristol | UK | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Eötvös Loránd University Tudományegyetem | HU | X |  |  | X | X |  | X |  |
| University of Cambridge | UK | X | X | X | X | X |  |  |  |
| Technische Universiteit Delft | NE | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| University of Edinburgh | UK | X | X |  | X |  |  |  | X |
| Albert-Ludwigs-Universität Freiburg | DE |  | X |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| University of Glasgow | UK | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Technische Universität Graz | AT |  | X |  |  |  | X | X |  |
| Ruprecht-Karls-Universität Heidelberg | DE | X | X |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| Helsingin Yliopisto | FI | X | X |  |  | X | X |  |  |
| Technische Universität Kaiserslautern | DE |  | X |  |  |  | X |  | X |
| Københavns Universitet | DK | X | X |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| École Polytechnique Fédérale de Lausanne | CH | X | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Katholieke Universiteit Leuven | BE | X | X |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| Johannes Kepler Universität Linz | AT |  | X |  | X |  |  |  | X |
| Imperial College London | UK | X | X | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| University College London, University of London | UK | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Université catholique de Louvain | BE | X | X |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| Lunds Universitet | SE |  | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Universidad Autónoma de Madrid | ES | X | X |  |  |  | X |  |  |
| Universidad Complutense de Madrid | ES | X |  |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| University of Manchester | UK | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Università degli Studi di Milano | IT | X |  |  | X |  |  | X |  |
| Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München | DE | X | X |  |  |  | X |  |  |
| Westfälische Wilhelms-Universität Münster | DE |  | X |  |  |  | X |  | X |
| University of Oxford | UK | X | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Università degli Studi di Padova | IT | X |  |  | X |  | X |  | X |
| Université Paris-Sud 11 | FR | X | X | X | X |  |  |  | X |
| Université Pierre et Marie Curie | FR | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Université Paris 7 - Denis Diderot | FR | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Univerzita Karlova v Praze | CZ | X |  |  |  |  | X | X | X |
| Université de Rennes 1 | FR | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Università di Roma Tor Vergata | IT | X | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| KTH Kungliga Tekniska Högskolan Stockholms | SE | X | X |  | X |  |  |  | X |
| Université Bordeaux 1 | FR | X | X |  |  |  |  |  | X |
| Politecnico de Torino | IT | X | X |  |  |  | X |  |  |
| Université Paul Sabatier | FR | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Norges Teknisk-Naturvitenskapelige Universitet | NO |  | X |  | X |  |  |  | X |
| Eberhard Karls Universität Tübingen | DE |  | X |  | X | X | X |  |  |
| Uppsala Universitet | SE | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |


| University | $\begin{aligned} & \geqq \\ & \grave{n} \\ & \vdots \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ |  |  |  |  | ERC grants |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Universiteit Utrecht | NE | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| The University of Warwick | UK | X | X |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| Medizinische Universität Wien | AT |  | X |  | X |  |  | X |  |
| Technische Universität Wien | AT | X |  |  | X |  | X |  | X |
| Universität Wien | AT | X | X |  | X | X | X |  |  |
| Eidgenössisch Technische Hochschule Zürich | CH | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |

### 4.3.5 Physics (2010)

Table 12: Stars Table Physics

| Country | Stars | Universities |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Germany | 53 | 16 |
| United Kingdom | 35 | 11 |
| The Netherlands | 23 | 6 |
| Italy | 22 | 8 |
| France | 21 | 6 |
| Spain | 17 | 5 |
| Sweden | 13 | 4 |
| Switzerland | 12 | 4 |
| Austria | 8 | 2 |
| Belgium | 7 | 2 |
| Denmark | 6 | 2 |
| Finland | 3 | 1 |
| Poland | 2 | 1 |
| Hungary | 2 | 1 |

Figure 7: Star distribution across countries in Physics


Legend: AT=Austria; BE=Belgium; CH=Switzerland; CZ=Czech Republic; DE=Germany; DK=Denmark; EE=Estonia; ES=Spain; FI=Finland; FR=France; HU=Hungary; IE=Ireland; IT=Italy; NE=The Netherlands; NO=Norway; PL=Poland; PT=Portugal; SE=Sweden; UK=United Kingdom

Table 13: Excellence Group Physics

| University | 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Rheinisch-Westfälische Technische Hochschule Aachen | DE | X | X |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| Aarhus Universitet | DK | X | X |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| Universiteit van Amsterdam | NE | X | X |  | X | X |  |  | X |
| Universitat de Barcelona | ES | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Universität Basel | CH |  | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Freie Universität Berlin | DE | X |  |  |  | X | X |  |  |
| Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin | DE | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| The University of Birmingham | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Rheinische Friedrich-Wilhelms-Universität Bonn | DE | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of Bristol | UK |  | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Université Libre de Bruxelles | BE | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Eötvös Loránd University Tudományegyetem | HU |  | X |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| University of Cambridge | UK | X | X | X | X | X |  |  |  |
| Technische Universiteit Delft | NE |  | X |  | X | X |  |  | X |
| Durham University Science Laboratories | UK | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of Edinburgh | UK | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Friedrich-Alexander-Universität Erlangen-Nürnberg | DE |  | X | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Università degli Studi di Firenze | IT | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Johann Wolfgang Goethe-Universität Frankfurt | DE | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Université de Geneve | CH |  | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Chalmers Tekniska Högskola | SE | X | X |  |  |  |  |  | X |
| Universidad de Granada | ES |  | X |  |  |  | X |  | X |
| Université Joseph Fourier Grenoble | FR | X | X |  |  | X |  |  | X |
| Rijksuniversiteit Groningen | NE | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Universität Hamburg | DE | X | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Ruprecht-Karls-Universität Heidelberg | DE | X | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Helsingin Yliopisto | FI | X | X |  |  | X |  |  |  |
| Friedrich-Schiller-Universität Jena | DE |  | X |  |  |  | X |  | X |
| Universität Karlsruhe | DE | X | X |  |  |  | X |  |  |
| Københavns Universitet | DK | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Universität zu Köln | DE | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| École Polytechnique Fédérale de Lausanne | CH | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Universiteit Leiden | NE | X | X |  | X | X |  |  | X |
| Katholieke Universiteit Leuven | BE | X |  |  | X | X |  |  | X |
| University of Liverpool | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Imperial College London | UK | X | X |  | X |  |  |  | X |
| University College London, University of London | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Lunds Universitet | SE | X | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Université Claude Bernard Lyon 1 | FR | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Universidad Autónoma de Madrid | ES | X | X |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| Universidad Complutense de Madrid | ES | X |  |  | X |  | X |  | X |
| Johannes Gutenberg-Universität Mainz | DE | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of Manchester | UK | X |  | X | X | X |  |  |  |
| Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München | DE | X | X | X | X |  | X |  | X |
| Technische Universität München | DE | X | X |  |  |  | X |  | X |
| Università degli Studi di Napoli Federico II | IT | X | X |  | X |  |  |  |  |
| Radboud Universiteit Nijmegen | NE |  | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| University of Oxford | UK | X | X |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Università degli Studi di Padova | IT | X | X |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Université Paris-Sud 11 | FR | X | X | X | X |  | X |  | X |



### 4.3.6 Political Science (2009)

Table 14: Stars Table Political Science

| Country | Stars | Universities |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| United Kingdom | 49 | 21 |
| Germany | 19 | 8 |
| Sweden | 7 | 2 |
| Switzerland | 6 | 3 |
| Denmark | 6 | 2 |
| Belgium | 6 | 2 |
| Italy | 5 | 2 |
| Czech Republic | 5 | 2 |
| The Netherlands | 4 | 2 |
| Finland | 4 | 1 |
| Poland | 3 | 1 |
| Norway | 3 | 1 |
| Estonia | 2 | 1 |
| Ireland | 2 | 1 |
| Spain | 2 | 1 |
| Hungary | 2 | 1 |

Figure 8: Star distribution across countries in Political Science


Legend: AT=Austria; BE=Belgium; CH=Switzerland; CZ=Czech Republic; DE=Germany; DK=Denmark; EE=Estonia; ES=Spain; FI=Finland; FR=France; HU=Hungary; IE=Ireland; IT=Italy; NE=The Netherlands; NO=Norway; PL=Poland; PT=Portugal; SE=Sweden; UK=United Kingdom

Table 15: Excellence Group Political Science

| University | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Z } \\ & \text { n } \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Aarhus Universitet | DK | X | X |  | X | X |  |
| Aberystwyth University | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Universiteit van Amsterdam | NE | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Universitat Pompeu Fabra | ES |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Queen's University Belfast | UK | X | X |  | X |  |  |
| Freie Universität Berlin | DE | X |  | X | X |  |  |
| Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin | DE | X |  |  | X |  |  |
| Universität Bern | CH |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| The University of Birmingham | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Università di Bologna | IT |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| University of Bristol | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Central European University | HU |  | X |  |  | X |  |
| Cardiff University | UK | X | X |  | X |  |  |
| Technische Universität Darmstadt | DE |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| University of Dublin, Trinity College | IE | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of Essex | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| European University Institute | IT | X | X |  |  |  | X |
| Johann Wolfgang Goethe-Universität Frankfurt | DE |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| University of Glasgow | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Göteborgs Universitet | SE |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| Helsingin Yliopisto | FI |  | X | X | X | X |  |
| Uniwersytet Jagiellonski | PL |  |  | X | X | X |  |
| Friedrich-Schiller-Universität Jena | DE |  | X | X | X |  |  |
| Københavns Universitet | DK | X |  | X |  |  |  |
| Universität Konstanz | DE | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of Lancaster | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of Lausanne | CH |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| University of Leeds | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Universiteit Leiden | NE | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Katholieke Universiteit Leuven | BE |  | X | X | X |  |  |
| London School of Economics and Political Science | UK | X | X |  |  |  | X |
| University College London, University of London | UK | X |  |  |  | X |  |
| Université catholique de Louvain | BE |  |  | X | X | X |  |
| University of Manchester | UK | X | X |  |  |  | X |
| Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München | DE | X |  | X |  |  |  |
| Newcastle University | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| The University of Nottingham | UK | X |  |  | X |  |  |
| Universitetet i Oslo | NO | X | X | X |  |  |  |
| University of Oxford | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Universität Potsdam | DE |  | X | X | X |  |  |
| Univerzita Karlova v Praze | CZ |  |  | X | X | X |  |
| Vysoká škola ekonomická v Praze | CZ | X |  |  |  | X |  |
| University of Salford | UK |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| University of Sheffield | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of Strathclyde | UK | X | X |  | X |  |  |
| University of Sussex | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Tartu Ülikool | EE |  | X |  |  | X |  |
| Uppsala Universitet | SE | X | X | X | X | X |  |
| The University of Warwick | UK | X | X |  | X |  |  |
| The University of York | UK | X | X |  |  | X |  |

CH $\quad \mathrm{X}$

### 4.3.7 Psychology (2009)

Table 16: Stars Table Psychology

| Country | Stars | Universities |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| United Kingdom | 48 | 22 |
| The Netherlands | 30 | 9 |
| Germany | 25 | 10 |
| Sweden | 9 | 4 |
| Belgium | 8 | 3 |
| Italy | 7 | 3 |
| France | 7 | 3 |
| Spain | 6 | 2 |
| Finland | 4 | 1 |
| Switzerland | 2 | 1 |
| Portugal | 2 | 1 |

Figure 9: Star distribution across countries in Psychology


Legend: AT=Austria; BE=Belgium; CH=Switzerland; CZ=Czech Republic; DE=Germany; DK=Denmark; EE=Estonia; ES=Spain; FI=Finland; FR=France; HU=Hungary; IE=Ireland; IT=Italy; NE=The Netherlands; NO=Norway; PL=Poland; PT=Portugal; SE=Sweden; UK=United Kingdom

Table 17: Excellence Group Psychology

| University | 2 $\vdots$ 0 0 0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| University of Aberdeen • King's College | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Université de Provence - Aix Marseille I | FR |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| Universiteit van Amsterdam | NE | X | X | X | X |  |  |
| Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam | NE | X | X |  | X |  |  |
| Bangor University | UK | X | X |  | X |  |  |
| Universitat de Barcelona | ES | X |  | X |  | X |  |
| University of Bath | UK |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin | DE | X | X | X |  |  |  |
| The University of Birmingham | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Università di Bologna | IT |  | X |  |  | X |  |
| University of Bristol | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of Cambridge | UK | X | X |  |  |  | X |
| Cardiff University | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Universidade de Coimbra | PT |  | X |  |  | X |  |
| University of Edinburgh | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of Essex | UK |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| Albert-Ludwigs-Universität Freiburg | DE | X |  | X |  |  |  |
| Universiteit Gent | BE | X | X |  | X |  |  |
| University of Glasgow | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Göteborgs Universitet | SE | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Rijksuniversiteit Groningen | NE | X | X | X | X |  |  |
| Ruprecht-Karls-Universität Heidelberg | DE | X |  | X |  |  |  |
| Helsingin Yliopisto | FI | X | X | X | X |  |  |
| Friedrich-Schiller-Universität Jena | DE | X |  | X | X |  |  |
| Universität Konstanz | DE |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| University of Leeds | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Universiteit Leiden | NE | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Universität Leipzig | DE | X |  | X | X |  |  |
| Katholieke Universiteit Leuven | BE | X |  | X | X |  |  |
| University of Liverpool | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| King's College London | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| University College London, University of London | UK | X | X |  |  |  | X |
| Université catholique de Louvain | BE | X |  |  | X |  |  |
| Université Lumière Lyon 2 | FR |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| Universiteit Maastricht | NE | X |  | X |  |  |  |
| University of Manchester | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Philipps-Universität Marburg | DE | X |  |  | X |  |  |
| Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München | DE | X | X |  | X |  |  |
| Radboud Universiteit Nijmegen | NE | X | X | X | X |  | X |
| Örebro universitet | SE |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| University of Oxford | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Università degli Studi di Padova | IT | X |  | X | X |  |  |
| L'Université Paris Descartes | FR | X |  |  | X | X |  |
| Università degli Studi di Roma La Sapienza | IT | X |  |  | X |  |  |
| Erasmus University Rotterdam | NE | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of Sheffield | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of Southampton | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Karolinska Institutet | SE | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| University of Sunderland | UK |  | X |  | X |  |  |
| University of Sussex | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Universiteit van Tilburg | NE | X | X |  | X |  | X |

RANKING

| University | Z <br>  <br>  <br> 0 |  | $\begin{aligned} & n \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Universität Trier | DE |  | X | X |  |  |  |
| Uppsala Universitet | SE | X | X |  | X |  |  |
| Universiteit Utrecht | NE | X | X | X | X |  |  |
| Universitat de València | ES | X |  | X |  | X |  |
| The University of Warwick | UK | X | X |  |  |  |  |
| Bayerische Julius-Maximilians-Universität Würzburg | DE | X |  | X | X |  |  |
| The University of York | UK | X | X |  |  |  | X |
| Universität Zürich | CH | X |  | X |  |  |  |

## 5 Results of the In-Depth-Analysis

The in-depth-analysis consisted of the institutional questionnaire in which a number of facts were asked from the departments and a student (master's and doctoral students) questionnaire.

Of all the indicators chosen for the ranking (i.e. with "stars" assigned) listed in section 3.2, the results regarding the proportion of international staff and students, the gender balance on different levels of qualification as well as on the overall study situation as judged by the students are reported here.

The results for the other indicators can be found in the online-version of the ranking (www.excellenceranking.org).

### 5.1 Institutional Survey

In order to identify the right contact person, the universities chosen for the in-depth analysis were contacted at the central level, usually the office of the vice-chancellor, president or equivalent. In addition, where the information was available, international offices were often identified as first contact points. The institutions were asked to name a contact person for the project. In the end, this varied from one person for the entire project to different persons for each subject and from academics to administrators. Not all institutions answered and others did, but stated that they were not interested in participating.

EXCELLENCE
RANKING

Table 18: Response rates in the institutional survey

| Subject (year of publication) | Universities <br> included in the survey | Universities <br> answering the questionnaire |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Biology (2010) | 76 | $43(56,6 \%)$ |
| Chemistry (2010) | 66 | $44(66,7 \%)$ |
| Economics (2009) | 69 | $34(49,3 \%)$ |
| Mathematics (2010) | 56 | $34(63,0 \%)$ |
| Physics (2010) | 69 | $51(73,9 \%)$ |
| Political Science (2009) | 51 | $27(52,9 \%)$ |
| Psychology (2009) | 59 | $37(62,7 \%)$ |

The questionnaire can be found at www.che-excellenceranking.eu.

### 5.1.1 Proportion of International Staff and Students

Table 19 shows the median proportion of internationals for the academic staff, doctoral and master's student as well as the number of cases (i.e. departments that answered the question). Figure 10 shows medians graphically.

Table 19: Proportion of international staff and students across subjects (in \%)

|  | Biology |  | Chemistry |  | Economics |  | Mathematics |  | Physics |  | Political Science |  | Psychology |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Md | N | Md | N | Md | N | Md | N | Md | N | Md | N | Md | N |
| staff | 22 | 32 | 15 | 39 | 15 | 34 | 20 | 29 | 19 | 46 | 10 | 26 | 9 | 34 |
| doctoral students | 29 | 41 | 25 | 43 | 42 | 35 | 30 | 25 | 25 | 49 | 29 | 27 | 13 | 32 |
| master's students |  | 37 | 14 | 41 | 20 | 29 | 23 | 29 | 14 | 48 | 18 | 22 | 19 | 30 |

Remarks: Md=Median; N=Number of cases
Figure 10: Proportion of international staff and students across subjects (in \%)

—int. staff (\%) int. doctoral students (\%) —int. master's students (\%)
With the exception of psychology, the degree of internationalisation is highest for the doctoral students, reaching a median of $42 \%$ in economics. In Biology, Chemistry and Physics, the median of the percentage of international academic staff is higher than the median percentage for the master's students. In Mathematics, Economics, Political Science and Psychology it is the other way around - the proportion of international master's students being higher than the proportion of international staff.

RANKING

### 5.1.2 Proportion of Female Staff and Students

Table 20 shows the median proportion of females for the academic staff, doctoral and master's student as well as the number of cases (i.e. departments that answered the question). Figure 11 shows medians graphically.

Table 20: Proportion of female staff and students across subjects (in \%)

|  | Biology |  | Chemistry |  | Economics |  | Mathematics |  | Physics |  | Political Science |  | Psychology |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Md | N | Md | N | Md | N | Md | N | Md | N | Md | N | Md | N |
| staff | 32 | 40 | 24 | 41 | 22 | 32 | 14 | 31 | 13 | 49 | 27 | 27 | 43 | 36 |
| doctoral students | 57 | 41 | 42 | 42 | 34 | 37 | 25 | 30 | 25 | 50 | 43 | 28 | 67 | 35 |
| master's students | 59 | 37 | 44 | 40 | 54 | 33 | 36 | 29 | 22 | 49 | 61 | 24 | 50 | 31 |

Remarks: Md=Median; N=Number of cases
Figure 11: Proportion of international staff and students across subjects (in \%)

_female staff female doctoral students female master's students

With the exception of psychology and physics, the median of the proportion of females is highest between the masters's students. In psychology, the proportion of female doctoral students is significantly higher, reaching as much as 67 percent. In all other subjects, except for physics, the median of the proportion of female doctoral students is smaller than the median of the master's students. The smallest proportion of females can be found between the academic staff, especially in physics and mathematics. This is a very common finding the proportion of women decreasing with the rising level of qualification.

### 5.2 Students' Judgements

The student survey used an online questionnaire both intended to master's students and to doctoral students. The questionnaire was accessible only via a certain web link and with a personal code. Anonymity of student identity was maintained. The universities could choose whether they wanted to invite the students via paper letters or e-mails containing the link and a personalised code.

RANKING

Table 21: Universities participating in the student surveys

| Subject | Universities <br> included in the survey | Universities <br> conducting a student survey |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Biology (2010) | 76 | $44(57,9 \%)$ |
| Chemistry (2010) | 66 | $46(69,7 \%)$ |
| Economics (2009) | 69 | $40(58 \%)$ |
| Mathematics (2010) | 56 | $31(55,4 \%)$ |
| Physics (2010) | 69 | $47(68,1 \%)$ |
| Political Science (2009) | 51 | $29(57 \%)$ |
| Psychology (2009) | 59 | $38(64,4 \%)$ |

The questionnaire can be found at www.che-excellenceranking.eu.

Students were asked for their opinions on different aspects of their study situations. They were provided with several statements like "the study conditions are excellent" and were asked to choose how much they agree with this statement, from "I agree very much" to "I don't agree at all." For computations and graphics, these judgements were translated to a scale from 1 = "very much agreement" to $6=$ "total disagreement."

Table 22: Details on the composition of the indicators

| Indicator <br> (mas. = master's students, <br> doc. $=$ doctoral students) | Short description |
| :---: | :---: |
| Overall study situation (mas.\&doc.) | Comprehensive judgement looking at the overall situation. |
| Advisory (mas.\&doc.) | Comprises judgements on the availability of advisors, their assistance in career planning, their caring for the student's personal development and the quality of counselling. |
| Career centres (mas.\&doc.) | Judgements on the assistance in finding an adequate employment position by the university's career centre, on informational events, student initiatives, partnerships with companies or research institutes, and the possibilities of internships. |
| Examinations (mas.\&doc.) | Contains judgements on the transparency of study and examination requirements, whether the coursework is in line with the content of the examinations, the fairness of examinations and the awarding of marks and organisational aspects. |
| Laboratories (mas.\&doc.) | Considers judgements on the state of the laboratories as well as the space and the equipment of laboratories. |
| Library (mas.\&doc.) | Judgements on the stock of literature (whether it is up-to-date, available and accessible) and on services such as search facilities or opening hours |
| Training (mas.\&doc.) | Includes judgements on the quality of theory and methodology training, the level of interdisciplinarity, the variety of course content and quality of instruction. |
| Study organisation (mas.\&doc.) | Comprises judgements on the transparency of admission conditions, assistance regarding formal procedures, and the organisational framework. |
| IT-infrastructure (mas.\&doc.) | Includes judgement on hardware equipment, subject-specific software, condition of computers and service. |
| Counselling (mas.\&doc.) | Judgements on admission, counselling on studying abroad, social and psychological counselling, counselling in relation to studies. |
| Websites (mas.\&doc.) | Judgements on the web sites of the department: information on organisational aspects, courses and research team. Availability of an English website. |
| Rooms (mas.\&doc.) | Students' opinions on the rooms: their condition, space and technical facilities |
| Social relations (mas.) | What students think about student organisations, contact to other students, teamwork and the relation to academic teaching staff. |
| Scientific community (doc.) | Doctoral students' judgements on the informal contact to the scientific community, contact to guest researchers, student organisations, teamwork and social relations to other students. |
| Conference attendance (doc.) | Doctoral students' opinions about the information on conferences, the time to prepare contributions for these and the financial support for visiting conferences. |
| Contact with other doctoral students (doc.) | Doctoral students' opinions about the teamwork with other PhD-students, PhD student organisations and discussions outside own team. |
| Publication possibilities (doc.) | What doctoral students think about their opportunity to publish and the counselling services on writing and placing papers. |
| Research community (doc.) | Doctoral students' judgements on the informal contact to the scientific community |

RANKING

| Indicator <br> (mas. = master's students, <br> doc. = doctoral students) | Short description |
| :--- | :--- |
|  | and guest researchers. |
| Teamwork (doc.) | What doctoral students think about team communication, organisation and social <br> relationships. |
| Time for PhD project (doc.) | Doctoral students judge whether they have enough time for writing their thesis. |
| Workroom (doc.) | Doctoral students' opinions about the state of the workroom, the space and the <br> computer equipment. |
| Workshops (doc.) | What doctoral students think about the possibilities to participate in workshops, <br> whether they get enough information about these and financial aid for them. |
| Research stay (doc.) | Doctoral students' opinions about their possibilities to arrange a research stay <br> abroad. |

The judgements were grouped according to the mean of the departments' students, the overall mean, the number of students answering, and the variation of their judgements. The following figure, for example, shows for chemistry the one-sided confidence intervals, the departments' mean judgements and the overall mean for one indicator - the overall work and study situation.

Universities with a confidence interval completely on the left side of the overall mean can be said to receive judgements above average and therefore belong to the top group in students' judgements. The rest of the universities remain in the intermediate group.

Figure 12: Error bar diagram for chemistry


Figure 13 shows the average judgements of students across fields for four of the above mentioned indicators: Advisory, Study organisation, Examinations and Library. Though the limited number of universities in the sample does not allow general conclusions from these
averages, one can see that the level of judgement does not differ that much throughout these fields.

Figure 13: Average student judgements across fields


## 6 References

Tavenas, François (2004). EUA Report "Quality Assurance: A Reference System for Indicators and Evaluation Procedures", EUA: Brussels.

Van Dyke (2005). "Twenty Years of University Report Cards." In: Higher Education in Europe, Vol. 30, No. 2, pp. 103-124.

Usher/Savino (2006). "A World of Difference: A Global Survey of University League Tables." Toronto, ON: Educational Policy Institute.

Marginson, Simon (2006). "Australian universities in the global context." Financial Review Higher Education Summit, 22-23 March, Sydney.


[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ Berghoff, Sonja; Brandenburg, Uwe; Carr-Boulay, Diane J; Hachmeister, Cort-Denis; Müller-Böling, Detlef: Identifying the Best: The CHE Ranking of Excellent European Graduate Programmes in Natural Sciences, Gütersloh, 2007. Online at: http://www.che.de/downloads/CHE AP124 ExcellenceRanking 2009.pdf
    ${ }^{2}$ See: http://www.excellenceranking.org
    ${ }^{3}$ The ExcellenceRanking is also closely related to the EU Tender for the development of a world ranking that has been won by CHERPA. CHERPA, or the Consortium for Higher Education and Research Performance Assessment, is a European network of leading institutions in the field of higher education. More information is available at: http://www.u-multirank.eu

[^1]:    ${ }^{4}$ See for example: Tavenas (2004), Van Dyke (2005), Usher/Savino (2006) and Marginson (2006).
    ${ }^{5}$ See: http://www.che.de/downloads/Berlin Principles IREG 534.pdf
    ${ }^{6}$ See: http://www.che-ranking.de/cms/?getObject=615\&getLang=en (Information on the project) or http://ranking.zeit.de (results)

[^2]:    ${ }^{7}$ The publication and citation indicators were computed the CWTS Leiden.
    ${ }^{8}$ See: http://www.koerber-stiftung.de/en/science/koerber-european-science-award.htm|

[^3]:    ${ }^{9}$ See: http://cordis.europa.eu/fp6/projects.htm, http://cordis.europa.eu/fp7/home en.html

[^4]:    ${ }^{10}$ http://ec.europa.eu/education/programmes/mundus/projects/index en.html
    ${ }^{11}$ http://erc.europa.eu/index.cfm?fuseaction=page.display\&topicID=65

